

1 Kevin T. Snider, State Bar No. 170988  
2 *Counsel of record*  
3 Michael J. Peffer, State Bar. No. 192265  
4 Matthew B. McReynolds, State Bar No. 234797  
5 PACIFIC JUSTICE INSTITUTE  
6 P.O. Box 276600  
7 Sacramento, CA 95827  
8 Tel. (916) 857-6900  
9 Email: ksnider@pji.org

7 Alexander M. Snyder (SBN 252058)  
8 Life Legal Defense Foundation  
9 P.O. Box 2015  
10 Napa, CA 94558  
11 Tel: 707.224.6675  
12 asnyder@lldf.org

11 Attorneys for Plaintiff

13 **IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**  
14 **FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

15 Jonee Fonseca, an individual parent and ) Case No.: 2:16-cv-00889 – KJM-EFB  
16 guardian of Israel Stinson, a minor, )  
17 Plaintiff, )  
18 Plaintiffs, ) **DECLARATION OF PAUL BYRNE,**  
19 v. ) **MD**  
20 Kaiser Permanente Medical Center )  
21 Roseville, Dr. Michael Myette M.D., Karen )  
22 Smith, M.D. in her official capacity as )  
23 Director of the California Department of )  
24 Public Health and Does 2 through 10, )  
25 inclusive, )  
26 Defendants. )

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**DECLARATION OF DR. PAUL BYRNE**

I, Paul Byrne, MD, am not a party to the above-encaptioned case and if called upon, I could and would testify truthfully, as to my own person knowledge, as follows:

Declarant, Paul A. Byrne, M.D., states as follows:

1. I have personal knowledge of all the facts contained herein and if called to testify as a witness I would and could competently testify thereto.
2. I am a physician licensed in Missouri, Nebraska and Ohio. I am Board Certified in Pediatrics and Neonatal-Perinatal Medicine. I have published articles on "brain death" and related topics in the medical literature, law literature and the lay press for more than thirty years. I have been qualified as an expert in matters related to central nervous system dysfunction in Michigan, Ohio, New Jersey, New York, Montana, Nebraska, Missouri, South Carolina, and the United States District Court for the Eastern District of Virginia.
3. I have reviewed the medical records of Israel Stinson, a 2-year-old boy, a patient in Kaiser Permanente, Roseville Hospital. I have visited Israel Stinson several times. On April 22 when I visited him, he was in the arms of his mother. A ventilator was in place.
4. I have continued to be in touch with Israel's parents. I have reviewed the videos that have been sent to me. Israel does move in these videos. If Israel were a cadaver, this is not possible, Thus Israel is alive.
5. The Guidelines of the AAN that the hospital claims to be following are not fulfilled. The Guidelines require that "Patients must lack all evidence of responsiveness." Israel is responsive.
6. Israel's intake has been only sugar, comparable to 7-Up since April 1. For more than a month Israel has been starved of protein, fat and vitamins.

1 7. Israel has had a tube in his trachea (ET tube) for more than a month. Every doctor  
2 knowledgeable in ENT and intensive care knows that a tracheostomy should have been  
3 done long before now.

4 8. Israel receives treatment for diabetes insipidus by medication administered  
5 intravenously. I have not been provided records as to how much and how often he has  
6 been given this medication. The patient's family and I agree this treatment should  
7 continue.

8 9. On April 4, Cranial Doppler showed "Near total absence of blood flow into the  
9 bilateral cerebral hemispheres." "Near total absence" is not evidence of no blood flow.

10 10. An apnea test has been done on Israel 3 times. Every time he was made acidotic and  
11 hypercapneic (increase in carbon dioxide). These tests could not have helped Israel.  
12 Further, the third time was after Israel's parents requested that such testing not be done  
13 again.

14 11. Endocrine abnormalities including hypothyroidism preclude any reliable evaluation  
15 of functioning of the brain. Thyroid blood studies were done on April 18. Results showed  
16 that Israel has hypothyroidism. Thyroid was started on April 18, but only once a day.

17 12. Prior to April 18 Israel was not tested or treated for his hypothyroidism, which has  
18 probably been present since his cardiorespiratory arrest. Thyroid hormone is necessary for  
19 ordinary normal health and healing of the brain. Thyroid medication that has been given to  
20 Israel can be a cause of his recent movements of his body. I recommend continued  
21 treatment and testing of thyroid functions.

22 13. The results of test of thyroid function of Israel Stinson are:

23 4/17/16 TSH: 0.07 (normal 0.7-5)

24 4/17/16: T4: 0.4 (Normal .8-1.7)

25 Israel's brain (hypothalamus) is not producing sufficient TSH, thyroid  
26 stimulating hormone, which has a half-life of only a few minutes. But he does have  
27 some TSH.

1 14. T4 is low and brain edema has turned into brain myxedema. When thyroid is given,  
2 brain circulation can increase and resume normal levels, thereby restoring normal  
3 neurological and hypothalamic function.

4 15. With proper medical treatment as proposed by his parents, Israel is likely to  
5 continue to live, and may find limited to full recovery of brain function, and may possibly  
6 regain consciousness.

7 16. Israel has a beating heart without support by a pacemaker or medications. Israel has  
8 circulation and respiration and many interdependent functioning organs including liver,  
9 kidneys and pancreas. In spite of low thyroid Israel's body manifests healing. Israel  
10 Stinson is a living person who passes urine and would digest food and have bowel  
11 movements if he were fed through a nasogastric or PEG tube. These are functions that do  
12 not occur in a cadaver after true death.

13 17. The criteria for "brain death" are multiple and there is no consensus as to which set  
14 of criteria to use (Neurology 2008). The criteria supposedly demonstrate alleged brain  
15 damage from which the patient cannot recover. However, there are many patients who  
16 have recovered after a declaration of "brain death." (See below.) Israel is not deceased;  
17 Israel is not a cadaver. Israel has a beating heart with a strong pulse, blood pressure and  
18 circulation. Israel makes urine and would digest food and have bowel movements if he is  
19 fed. These are indications that Israel is alive.

20 18. The latest scientific reports indicate that patients deemed to be "brain dead" are  
21 actually neurologically recoverable. I recognize that such treatments are not commonly  
22 done. Further it is recognized that the public and the Court must be wondering why doctors  
23 don't all agree that "brain death" is true death. Israel, like many others, continues to live in  
24 spite of little or no attention to detail necessary for treating a person on a ventilator. Israel,  
25 like all of us needs thyroid hormone. Many persons are on thyroid hormone because they  
26 would die without it.

27  
28

---

DECLARATION OF PAUL BYRNE, MD

1 19. Israel Stinson may achieve even complete or nearly complete neurological recovery  
2 if he is given proper treatment soon. Every day that passes, Israel is deprived of adequate  
3 nutrition and careful administration thyroid hormone required for healing.

4 20. The questions presented here refer to (1) the unreliability of methods that have been  
5 used to identify death and (2) the fact that no therapeutic methods that would enable brain  
6 recovery have been used so far. In fact, the implementation of nutrition and adequate  
7 therapeutic methods are being obstructed in the hope that Israel's heart stops beating,  
8 thereby precluding his recovery through the implementation of new therapeutic  
9 methodologies.

10 21. Israel Stinson's brain is probably supplied by a partially reduced level of blood  
11 flow, insufficient to allow full functioning of his brain, such as control of respiratory  
12 muscles and production of a hormone controlled by the brain itself. This is called thyroid  
13 stimulating hormone, TSH, which then stimulates the thyroid gland to produce its own  
14 hormones. With insufficient amount TSH Israel has hypothyroidism. The consequent  
15 deficiency of thyroid hormones sustains cerebral edema and prevents proper functioning of  
16 the brain that control respiratory muscles.

17 22. On the other hand, partially reduced blood flow to his brain, despite being sufficient  
18 to maintain vitality of the brain, is too low to be detected through imaging tests currently  
19 used for that purpose. Employing these methods currently used for the declaration of  
20 "brain death" confounds NO EVIDENCE of circulation to his brain with actual ABSENCE  
21 of circulation to his brain. Both reduced availability of thyroid hormones and partial  
22 reduction of brain blood flow also inhibit brain electrical activity, thereby preventing the  
23 detection of brain waves on the EEG. The methods currently used for the declaration of  
24 "brain death" confound flat brain waves with the lack of vitality of the cerebral cortex. It is  
25 noted that EEG has not been done on Israel Stinson.

26 23. In 2013, Jahi McMath was in hospital in Oakland, CA. When I visited her in the  
27 hospital in Oakland, Jahi was in a condition similar to Israel. A death certificate was issued  
28

1 on Jahi on December 12, 2013. Jahi was transferred to New Jersey where tracheostomy  
2 and gastrostomy were done and thyroid medication was given. Multiple neurologists  
3 recently evaluated Jahi and found that she no longer fulfills any criteria for “brain death.  
4 Since Jahi has been in New Jersey, she has had her 14<sup>th</sup> and 15<sup>th</sup> birthdays. The doctors in  
5 Oakland declared Jahi dead and issued a death certificate. Jahi’s mother said no to taking  
6 Jahi’s organs and no to turning off her ventilator. Israel’s parents are saying no to taking  
7 Israel’s organs and to taking away his life support. Just like Jahi’s mother!

8 24. Even a person in optimal clinical condition would be at risk of death after weeks of  
9 hypothyroidism and only sugar (similar to only 7-up). Israel Stinson needs a Court order  
10 requiring Kaiser Permanente to actively promote the implementation of all measures  
11 necessary for Israel’s survival and neurological recovery, including tracheostomy,  
12 gastrostomy, thyroid hormone, and proper nutrition to prevent death.

13 25. Israel Stinson needs the following procedures done:

- 14 a. Tracheostomy and gastrostomy
- 15 b. Serum T3, T4, TSH and TRH (thyroid releasing hormone).
- 16 c. Levothyroxine 25 mcg nasogastrically, nasogastrically or IV every 6  
17 hours the first day; dose needs to be adjusted thereafter in accord with  
TSH, T3 and T4.
- 18 d. Samples for lab tests for growth hormone (maybe serum samples can be  
19 frozen for future non-STAT tests).
- 20 e. Serum insulin-like growth factor I (IGF-I) to evaluate growth hormone  
21 deficiency.
- 22 f. Parathormone (PTH) and 25(OH)D3 to evaluate vitamin D deficiency  
and replacement.
- 23 g. Continue to follow electrolytes (sodium, chloride, potassium,  
24 magnesium, total and ionized calcium), creatinine and BUN.
- 25 h. Continued monitoring of blood gases.
- 26 i. Serum albumin and protein levels.
- 27 j. CBC including WBC with differential and platelet count.

- 1 k. Urinalysis (including quantitative urine culture and 24-hour urine  
2 protein).
- 3 l. Continue accurate Intake and Output.
- 4 m. Diet with 40 g of protein per day (nasoenterically or nasogastrically). Fat  
5 intravenous until feedings are into stomach.
- 6 n. IV fluids (volume and composition to be changed according to daily  
7 serum levels of electrolytes (sodium, chloride, potassium, magnesium,  
8 total and ionized calcium) and fluid balance.
- 9 o. Water, nasoenterically or nasogastrically, if necessary to treat  
10 hypernatremia – volume and frequency according to serum sodium.
- 11 p. Fludrocortisone Acetate (Florinef®) Tablets USP, 0.1 mg - one  
12 tablet (nasoenterically or nasogastrically) per day;
- 13 q. Prednisone 10 mg (nasoenterically or nasogastrically) twice per day;
- 14 r. Continue Vasopressin IM, or Desmopressin acetate nasal spray (DDAVP  
15 – synthetic vasopressin analogue) one or two times per day according to  
16 urinary output;
- 17 s. Human growth hormone (somatropin) [0.006 mg/kg/day (12 kg = 0.07  
18 mg per day)] subcutaneously;
- 19 t. Arginine Alpha Ketoglutarate (AAKG) powder 10 g diluted in water  
20 (nasoenterically or nasogastrically) four times per day;
- 21 u. Pyridoxal-phosphate ("coenzymated B6", PLP) - sublingual  
22 administration four times per day;
- 23 v. Taurine 2 g diluted in water (nasoenterically or nasogastrically) four  
24 times per day;
- 25 w. Cholecalciferol 30,000 IU three times per day (nasoenterically or  
26 nasogastrically) for 3 days. Then 7,000 IU three times per day  
27 (nasoenterically or nasogastrically) from day 4.
- 28 x. Riboflavin 20 mg four times per day (nasoenterically or nasogastrically)
- y. Folic acid 5 mg two times per day (nasoenterically or nasogastrically).
- z. Vitamin B12 1,000 mcg once per day (nasoenterically or nasogastrically).
- aa. Concentrate / mercury-free omega-3 (DHA / EPA) 3 cc four times per  
day (nasoenterically or nasogastrically).

- bb. Chest physiotherapy
- cc. Blood gases; adjust ventilator accordingly.
- dd. Keep oxygen saturation 92-98%
- ee. Air mattress that cycles and rotates air.
- ff. Pressor agents to keep BP at 70-80/50-60.

26. In a situation such as this where continued provision of life-sustaining measures such as ventilator, medications, water and nutrition are at issue, it is my professional judgment that the decision regarding their appropriateness rests with the family, not the medical profession.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed this 6<sup>th</sup> Day of May, 2016.

S/ Paul Byrne, MD  
Paul Byrne, MD